The ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, Europe 1100 - 1800 presents:



change collaboratory

lmage: Reliquary bust of one of Saint Ursula's virgins anonymous, c. 1325 - c. 1349. © Rijksmuseum.

ART, OBJECTS AND EMOTIONS

DATE:

VENUE: Woodward Conference Centre. 10th floor, Melbourne Law

CONVENERS: Charles Zika and

REGISTER online at historyofemotions.

Full: \$40 for both days, \$20 for one day

For more information:

'Art' wrote Susanne Langer 'is the objectification of feeling.' A century earlier, Paul Cezanne had made the more extravagant claim 'A work of art which did not begin in emotion is not art.' Although the impulse to define art in such succinct and finite terms might be deemed an essentially modern one, the wider notion of the inseparability of art and emotion, and the power of art to evoke strong feelings in viewers has a long history. In more recent times scholars have also begun to explore the role of material objects in human relationships through their power to evoke strong emotions. Artistic and non-artistic objects can generate desire and also violence, pride, belonging, devotion and disgust.

This collaboratory will consider the manifold ways in which art and objects depict, reflect, symbolise, communicate and regulate emotion in Europe in the period from c.1400 to c.1800, a period when objects of all kinds circulated widely and began to be systematically collected and displayed. From so-called fine art such as painting and sculpture, to decorative art and all manner of objects, we will examine the role of emotion in shaping our conception of art and objects, and likewise, of art and objects in shaping our understanding of emotion.

SPEAKERS: Lisa Beaven (Art History, The University of Melbourne), Thomas Dixon (History, Queen Mary University of London), Stephanie Downes (Literature, The University of Melbourne), Elina Gertsman (Art History, Case Western Reserve University), Sasha Handley (History, The University of Manchester), Angela Hesson (Art History/Literature, The University of Melbourne), Angela McShane (Victoria & Albert Museum/History, The University of Sheffield), Matthew Martin (Curator, NGV), Shelley Perlove (Art History, The University of Michigan-Dearborn), Sarah Randles (University of Tasmania), Corine Schleif (Art History, Arizona State University), Gary Schwartz (Art History, Independent Scholar), Miya Tokumitsu (Art History, The University of Melbourne) and Charles Zika (History, The University of Melbourne).







TUESDAY 15 NOVEMBER 2016	
TIME	SPEAKERS
8.45 - 9.15	Registration & Coffee
9.15 – 9.45	Welcome
9.45 – 11.15	Elina Gertsman (Art History, Case Western Reserve University), "The Penitence of the Wicked"
	 Corine Schleif (Art History, Arizona State University), Adam Kraft's Seven Falls of Christ: Walking the History of Emotions in Nuremberg
11.15 – 11.45	MORNING TEA
11.45 – 1.15	• Sasha Handley (History, The University of Manchester), Marriage, Mourning and Martyrdom: The History of an Eighteenth-Century English Bedsheet
	• Angela McShane (Victoria & Albert Museum/History, The University of Sheffield), An Object Full of Feeling: Art, Emotion and the Early Modern Tobacco Box
1.15 – 2.15	LUNCH
2.15 – 3.45	Miya Tokumitsu (Art History, The University of Melbourne), Labours of Love? Work, Materials and Emotion in Early Modern Germany
	• Gary Schwartz (Art History, Independent Scholar, Amsterdam), Love of Art/Love in Art as Epitomized in Antwerp
3.45 – 4.15	AFTERNOON TEA
4.15 – 5.00	 Angela Hesson (Art History/Literature, The University of Melbourne), The Stuff of Love and Longing: Miniatures, Mourning, and the Paradoxical Pleasure of Absence
6.30 for 7.00	CONFERENCE DINNER AT THE CARLTON WINE ROOM

WEDNESDAY 16 NOVEMBER 2016	
TIME	SPEAKERS
9.00 - 9.30	Registration & Coffee
9.30 – 11.00	• Lisa Beaven (Art History, The University of Melbourne), Images that Harm: Pain and Suffering in Seventeenth-Century European Paintings
	• Shelley Perlove (Art History, The University of Michigan-Dearborn), 'The Gaping Wound Exposed for All to See' (Ovid, Fasti, II): Rembrandt's Lucretia and the Passions
11.00 – 11.30	MORNING TEA
11.30 – 1.00	 Matthew Martin (Curator, NGV), Celebrating Virtues: The Zwettler Tafelaufsatz Charles Zika (History, The University of Melbourne), Relics and Images: The Distribution of Power, Materiality and Emotion at the Austrian Shrine of Mariazell
1.00 – 2.00	LUNCH
2.00 – 3.30	• Stephanie Downes (Literature, The University of Melbourne), The Art of Reading in the Middle Ages: An Emotional History of the Book
	Sarah Randles (History, University of Tasmania), Impressions: Wax and Emotions in the Middle Ages
3.30 – 4.00	AFTERNOON TEA
4.00 - 5.00	Response & Discussion, Thomas Dixon (History, Queen Mary University of London).

EMOTIONS MAKE HISTORY

ABSTRACTS

Lisa Beaven

IMAGES THAT HARM: PAIN AND SUFFERING IN SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY EUROPEAN PAINTINGS

In this paper I intend to explore the agency granted to paintings of horror and pain in seventeenth-century Europe. The potential of such images to hurt or harm their audiences was taken very seriously by art theorists. Gabriele Paleotti, for example, argued that 'all such things are not just lacking in utility, they greatly deprave the human sense as things beastlike and utterly irrational'. Yet the reception of such pictures points to a dichotomy between the violent subject matter depicted and an admiration of the verisimilitude of the technique that made intense emotional engagement possible. Horror and pleasure, or even delight, could be felt simultaneously on viewing these works, and indeed could combine to heighten the thrill felt by the spectator. The voque for images of violence and suffering was due in part to their ability to function as a vehicle for the expression of the passions, but I would like to explore the possibility they also reflected challenges to the traditional Galenic theory of pain by new developments in medicine.

LISA BEAVEN is a postdoctoral research fellow in the ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions. She has published widely on aspects of patronage and collecting in seventeenth-century Rome and her current research project with the centre is on the sensory and emotional interaction between people and works of art and relics in seventeenth-century Rome.

Stephanie Downes

THE ART OF READING IN THE MIDDLE AGES: AN EMOTIONAL HISTORY OF THE BOOK

As a material source for emotions history, the book is hard to read: it exists in both semiotic and physical states simultaneously; it is represented as an object in art, and is itself a potential object of art. In this paper I argue that with its ability to be both sign and object simultaneously, we might explore the manifestations and representations of the codex during the later Middle Ages to bring us closer to an understanding of what attention to the materiality of textual forms might bring to the history of emotions in general. I draw, here, especially on my research on 'decorative' faces added to letter forms in manuscripts containing literary and philosophical works during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, to consider how the visual aspects of the

material text may have shaped private reading practices. Often dismissed as 'ornamentental' – simple embellishments of the text – I argue that scribal faces were deliberately inserted into certain works, frequently appearing at moments of elevated narrative intensity. Acting as either model or mirror for the face of the individual lay reader, the scribal face imagines a moment of human encounter, constructing the art of reading as the art of compassionate feeling.

STEPHANIE DOWNES is a postdoctoral research fellow in the ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions at the University of Melbourne. She has published on aspects of Anglo-French textual cultures and their reception from the Middle Ages through to the modern era. Her forthcoming monograph is titled *Reading Christine de Pizan in England*, 1399-1929 (Boydell & Brewer). With Andrew Lynch and Katrina O'Loughlin she is the editor of *Emotions and War: Medieval to Romantic Literature* (Palgrave), and with Sarah Randles and Sally Holloway, *Feeling Things: Emotions and Objects through History* (OUP, forthcoming 2017).

Elina Gertsman

"THE PENITENCE OF THE WICKED"

Hieronymus Bosch's *Christ Carrying the Cross*, one of his last authenticated paintings, is a merciless study of humanity lost. In the center, the pallid Christ carries an enormous crossbeam, surrounded by a crowd of hostile and violent men. The painting tends to elude scholarly notice; when it does come under scrutiny, the image is usually discussed in terms of attribution or cross-cultural influences. This paper, instead, focuses on the *Carrying of the Cross* as a site of response that targets the late medieval beholder's complex system of feelings, in order to catalyze a spiritually reformative process by eliciting despair.

ELINA GERTSMAN is Professor of Medieval Art at Case Western Reserve University. She is the author and editor of several books that explore a range of topics, including late medieval macabre; medieval image theory; performance/performativity; multi-sensory reception processes; devotional sculpture; and medieval concepts of emotion and affectivity. She is a recipient of many fellowships and awards, including those from the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Mellon and Kress Foundations, and the American Council of Learned Societies. Her new book project explores emptiness in late medieval art. A centennial exhibition Myth and Mystique she has co-curated opened this October at the Cleveland Museum of Art.

Sasha Handley

MARRIAGE, MOURNING AND MARTYRDOM: THE HISTORY OF AN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY ENGLISH BEDSHEET

This paper examines the production, use and meanings of an ordinary household object: a single English bedsheet dating to the early eighteenth century. The regimes of value, locations, and hands through which the sheet travelled will be examined in this paper. alongside the haptic dimensions of its initial creation in the early eighteenth century; its perception and use as a holy relic; its commercialization amongst nineteenthcentury antiquarians; through to its adoption as a commemorative political object within a twenty-first century Museum collection. Different representations of, and interactions with this bedsheet fostered a shifting set of sensory and emotional experiences for specific individuals, religious communities, political activists, and cultural organisations at each stage of its life-cycle, which transformed this once-mundane everyday object into an object of personal, spiritual and artistic veneration.

SASHA HANDLEY is Senior Lecturer in early modern history at the University of Manchester. Her chief interests lie in histories of supernatural belief, material culture and everyday life in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century England. Her publications include Visions of an Unseen World: Ghost Beliefs and Ghost Stories in Eighteenth-Century England (2007) and Sleep in Early Modern England (2016). In 2015 she co-founded the research group Embodied Emotions with Jenny Spinks at the University of Manchester. Jenny and Sasha also co-curated the exhibition Magic, Witches and Devils in the Early Modern World at Manchester's John Rylands Library in 2016.

Angela Hesson

THE STUFF OF LOVE AND LONGING: MINIATURES, MOURNING, AND THE PARADOXICAL PLEASURE OF ABSENCE

Delicately slipping between emotional and physical realms, portrait miniatures, love tokens and mourning jewels maintained a profound relationship to both the imagination and the body, often worn against it, sometimes fashioned from it. The inclusion of hair, whether as a reminder of an absent loved one, or in memory of a deceased one, provided a literal sense of physical proximity to the object of affection, serving as a focus for private and public displays of feeling. Distinct from dowries or contractual gifts, these objects symbolised intimacy, and often, in their inherent corporeality, desire. This paper will examine the manner in which love, loss and longing were fetishised through

miniatures and mourning jewels from the seventeenth to the nineteenth century, and the ways in which their production, distribution and use served to regulate and materialise emotion.

ANGELA HESSON is a curator and academic currently appointed by the CHE to curate an exhibition at the National Gallery of Victoria on the theme of love. Prior to her appointment at CHE, she was employed as a lecturer in art history and literature at The University of Melbourne and at La Trobe University. From 2010-2013, she worked as a curator at The Johnston Collection, a Melbourne house museum specialising in seventeenth-nineteenth century fine and decorative art. Much of her research to date has focused upon theories of fetishism and their relationship to femininity, and to practices of collection and connoisseurship.

Matthew Martin

CELEBRATING VIRTUES: THE ZWETTLER TAFELAUFSATZ

In 1768 the Abbot Rayner Kollman of the monastery of Zwettl in Lower Austria celebrated the 50th jubilee of his profession as a Cistercian religious. This occasion was marked by elaborate celebrations held on 17 April of that year. Famously, Joseph Haydn was commissioned to write an Applausus musicus, to be performed at the event. In addition to this musical composition, the jubilee celebrations featured another significant artistic commission – an extensive porcelain dessert service which included a large-scale Tafelaufsatz, commissioned from the State Vienna Porcelain Factory. This table centrepiece included a central group of allegorical porcelain sculptures representing the cardinal virtues, the same characters who feature in Haydn's cantata. These in turn relate to ceiling frescos of the cardinal virtues executed by Paul Troger in 1733 in the monastery library. This paper will explore the function of these artistic commissions in the communal celebrations of thanksgiving for the vocation of Abbot Kollmann and the significance of these celebrations in the larger context of contemporary debates about the continuing relevance of monasticism in the Holy Roman Empire in the eighteenth century. In particular, the significance of commissioning images in the still relatively recently mastered medium of European porcelain for staging and commemorating these festivities will be investigated.

MATTHEW MARTIN is Curator of International Decorative Arts in the National Gallery of Victoria. His research interests include eighteenth-century European porcelain and sculptural aesthetics and the role of confessional identity in eighteenth-century artists' networks. He recently curated the exhibition *Eighteenth-Century Porcelain Sculpture*, currently on show at the National Gallery of Victoria.

Angela McShane

AN OBJECT FULL OF FEELING: ART, EMOTION AND THE EARLY MODERN TOBACCO BOX

Tobacco boxes played a central part in the development of a highly ritualised set of social and cultural practices for individuals and institutional groups in early modern Britain. If performed in company, these rituals frequently involved talk, borrowings, and a gamut of emotions from frustration to satisfaction. A personalized box for snuff or tobacco was a vital accessory for a man, whether he was a labourer or a lord; it was a constant companion and invested with such great sentimental value that in songs, plays and jests, men gave or begueathed their beloved tobacco box to the women of their dreams as a sure pledge of total fidelity. They were often given as gifts to civic groups, becoming repositories of shared memory and tradition. Boxes were also cultural carriers that inspired high level mechanic skill and decorative vocabularies, but in this paper I am most interested in boxes that display 'self-narratives' of amateur inscription, adoption and adaptation of images and identities over time. Though often highly routinized in form, and even factory-made by the eighteenth century, boxes were nevertheless canvases on which individual statements of love, fear, triumph and reflection were frequently made.

ANGELA MCSHANE is a Senior Research and External Engagement Fellow at the V&A. A social and cultural historian, she is broadly interested in popular politics and the material culture of the everyday in early modern society. Dr McShane is the Coinvestigator for the ESRC/AHRC Intoxicants and Early Modernity project: https://www.intoxicantsproject.org/

Shelley Perlove

'THE GAPING WOUND EXPOSED FOR ALL TO SEE ...' (OVID, FASTI, II): REMBRANDT'S LUCRETIA AND THE PASSIONS.

Cicero claimed that the suffering of an innocent victim moved an audience more than any other subject. This may not be doubted when considering Rembrandt's disturbing image of Lucretia of 1666, where the Roman matron is portrayed in the very throes of death by suicide, after her dishonour by the Tarquinian king's son. The artist's interpretation is unusual, since it plays down the eroticism of the subject and focuses upon her plaintive, yet 'manly' demeanour just before her collapse at the feet of her relatives, with the bright, red blood streaming from

her wound. As demonstrated here, Rembrandt, as *pathopoeia*, the maker of emotion, drew upon the texts of both Livy and Ovid, as well as others, to embody within a single image the most dramatic elements of the narrative. Lucretia's call for revenge and the consequent rebellion against the Tarquinian tyrants resonate with contemporary anxieties over the imperilled freedom of the Dutch Republic, faced with the threat of a restituted monarchy.

SHELLEY PERLOVE is a well-known scholar of early modern European art, who has been Visiting Professor at the University of Michigan since her retirement in 2012. Professor Perlove specializes in art and religious culture, especially art and the Bible, seventeenth-century drawings, and visual typology in sixteenth-century art. She is the author of two award-winning books published by Penn State University Press: Bernini and the Idealization of Death, and more recently with Larry Silver, Rembrandt's Faith: Church and Temple in the Dutch Golden Age. Professor Perlove served on the scientific team of the exhibition which opened at the Louvre in 2011, Rembrandt and the Face of Jesus, and was also contributing author to the catalogue. She is currently working on a book on Rembrandt's followers.

Sarah Randles

IMPRESSIONS: WAX AND EMOTIONS IN THE MIDDLE AGES

In The Cultural Politics of Emotion Sara Ahmed writes about emotions in terms of 'impressions', stating that they are 'about objects, which they hence shape, and are also shaped by contact with objects'. While Ahmed makes it clear that she is not only talking about material objects, in the Middle Ages the material properties of wax, particularly its malleability, flammability and ability to hold an impression, meant that it was ideally suited to perform emotional work. The spiritual properties of wax, especially its relationship to the Virgin Mary, were also integral to its emotional uses. This paper will draw upon visual, material and documentary evidence to consider the use of wax in various forms, including as seals, candles, ex votos and effigies, as emotional proxies in religious and social ritual. In particular, it will focus on the ability of wax to represent the human body and therefore embodied emotions, as well as its function in creating a sensory devotional space, in the form of candles. The discussion of wax in its various forms as 'emotional object' will further contribute to ongoing debate on the relationship between emotions and the material world.

SARAH RANDLES is an Honorary Research Fellow in the School of Historical and Philosophical Studies at the University of Melbourne, an Adjunct Researcher at the University of Tasmania, and was recently a postdoctoral fellow in the ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions. Her current research project explores the emotions of pilgrimage and sacred place, focusing on the relics and other aspects of material culture of Chartres Cathedral. She has also published on medieval and later textiles, the Arthurian legend and on medievalism in Australian architecture.

Corine Schleif

ADAM KRAFT'S SEVEN FALLS OF CHRIST: WALKING THE HISTORY OF EMOTIONS IN NUREMBERG

The so-called Stations of the Cross, sculpted by Adam Kraft around 1500, have led Nuremberg pilgrims and mourners out through the city gate to the St. Johannis Cemetery for many generations. Six scenes showing Christ on his way to Calvary, placed at intervals along a major thoroughfare, culminated in a free-standing Crucifixion and final reliefs showing the Lamentation and Entombment. Displaying the utmost trauma of physical pain and death as the focal points of intense emotional upheaval and conflict, these closely-knit narratives exhibit feelings ranging from scornful hatred and heated wrath to smug sadism and cunning arrogance to patient meekness and generous forgiveness to heart-felt sorrow, loving sympathy and all-consuming empathy. The paper will show how these stone monuments with chiselled inscriptions provided permanent fixtures in the cityscape and participated performatively in public and personal histories from the late Middle Ages through the Lutheran Reformation and the National Socialist era. Abundant records document the enduring importance of these sculptures as historic works of art. The paper will consider their dynamic involvement in real events, struggles over gender and race, political movements, and economic situations against the recurring emphasis on their preservation as static authoritative historicity.

CORINE SCHLEIF, who teaches medieval and Renaissance art at Arizona State University, has published widely on issues of donation, memory, and self-representation, often focusing her analyses on German art and particularly on cultural connections and reception of artistic production in late-medieval Nuremberg, e.g. Donatio et Memoria (1990), Katerina's Windows (with V. Schier 2009), and Adam Kraft and the Sculpting of Art's History (in progress). Professor Schleif currently directs collaborative projects examining multisensory experiences, e.g. Opening the Geese Book http://geesebook.asu.edu and on virtual-reality explorations of empathy facilitated through new digital technologies, e.g. http://extraordinary sensescapes. asu.edu

Gary Schwartz

LOVE OF ART/LOVE IN ART AS EPITOMIZED IN ANTWERP

As if in anticipation of the subject of the Melbourne project, love of art and its depiction were thematized by the Antwerp *kunstkamer* painter Guillam van Haecht (aka Willem van Haecht) in the 1620s and '30s. His best-known painting, *The Kunstkamer of Cornelis van*

der Geest, is a declaration of love for art as well as a picture of the competition between two art lovers in terms described at the time as romantic conquest. An investigation of van Haecht's other paintings reveals a panoply of love themes, ranging from the heights of divine love to base carnality. The pictures-within-the-pictures extend love themes to within the pores of his paintings.

The artistic means that van Haecht uses to display the emotion of love are shown to reside not in facial expression or body language but in exploiting the viewer's pre-existing knowledge of the surrounding circumstances.

GARY SCHWARTZ is an independent art historian who works mainly on Dutch and Flemish art of the seventeenth century, with the temperamental opposites Rembrandt and Pieter Saenredam as particular specialties. His latest book and the coming one widen the emotional split even farther, being on Jheronimus Bosch and Johannes Vermeer. Schwartz claims that this is mere happenstance and that it plays no role in the books themselves. More germane to the topic of the conference is that in 2014 he was guest curator, for the Frans Hals Museum in Haarlem, of the first exhibition ever mounted on emotion in Dutch seventeenth-century painting.

Miya Tokumitsu

LABOURS OF LOVE? WORK, MATERIALS AND EMOTION IN EARLY MODERN GERMANY

In an unusual relief sculpture from c. 1525, Hans Leinberger depicted a funeral mass held for victims of a mining accident. To the right is the collapsed mine; an alarmed man emerges from its opening as an angel reaching for him indicates his miraculous survival. To the left are mourners at the mass, deep in grief. This work provides a rare glimpse into the human cost of southern Germany's famed metalwork industry and the emotional ripples that this work sent through communities. Since the Middle Ages, German miners were aware of the physical dangers of mining. Through lung disease and physical injury, mining altered their bodies, and consequently how they sensed and moved through the world. Recent scholarship reveals the range of emotions sparked by artistic materials in early modern Europe, such as wonder, desire and envy. This paper contributes to the discussion by focusing on how the labours of procuring, transporting, and crafting artistic materials bore upon the emotional lives of early modern workers and society.

MIYA TOKUMITSU is a lecturer in early modern art history at the University of Melbourne. Her art historical research focuses primarily on artisanal labour of medieval and early modern Europe, but she is interested in rhetorics of work and labour across the ages. Dr Tokumitsu is the author of *Do What You Love. And Other Lies about Success and Happiness* (Regan Arts, 2015) and is a contributing editor at Jacobin.

Charles Zika

RELICS AND IMAGES: THE DISTRIBUTION OF POWER, MATERIALITY AND EMOTION AT THE AUSTRIAN SHRINE OF MARIAZELL

Like many other Marian pilgrimage sites, the Austrian shrine of Mariazell promoted a range of rituals and devotions associated with particular objects such as statues, paintings, relics, votive gifts and altars, many of which became the source of countless miracles. These miracles brought comfort and liberation to pilgrims, as well as status and power to the shrine's custodians and donors. The Counter-Reformation revival of the shrine by the Hapsburgs from the 1580s led to the donation of numerous precious objects. The most prominent were the bones and skulls of martyr saints from the Roman catacombs in the 1650s, which were wrapped in silk and adorned with jewels and pearls to create elaborate Baroque shrines. Military conflict with the Turks also recharged the power for collective deliverance and victory attributed to a fourteenth-century painting, the so-called *Treasury* Image, which also gained new prominence within the shrine's complex physical and ritual organization.

The paper will explore how the materiality and origins of these different objects, in particular images and relics, could arouse different sets of emotions within devotees, and how tradition, ritual and the capacity for reproduction and appropriation helped shape an economy of emotional expectation and benefit.

CHARLES ZIKA is a Chief Investigator in the ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions at the University of Melbourne. His interests lie in the intersection of religion, emotion, visual culture and print in early modern Europe. Professor Zika's most recent publications include *Disaster, Death and the Emotions in the Shadow of the Apocalypse, 1400-1700* (edited with Jenny Spinks; Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), as well as articles on apocalyptic time and emotion, the witch of Endor in late medieval and seventeenth-century representation, anger and dishonor in sixteenth-century broadsheets, Sabbath rituals and ridicule, and cruelty in the witchcraft imagery of Jacques de Gheyn II.

DISCUSSANT

THOMAS DIXON is the Director of the Centre for the History of the Emotions at Queen Mary University of London. His books include From Passions to Emotions: The Creation of a Secular Psychological Category (2003), The Invention of Altruism: Making Moral Meanings in Victorian Britain (2008), and Weeping Britannia: Portrait of a Nation in Tears (2015). Professor Dixon is currently researching anger and rage as part of a collaborative Wellcome Trust project entitled *Living* With Feeling: Emotional Health in History, Philosophy, and Experience. His broadcast projects have included a television programme about science and religion and a BBC Radio series entitled Five Hundred Years of Friendship. He is a Partner Investigator of the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions 1100-1800. and is visiting Perth, Adelaide, and Melbourne during November 2016.



MOURNING PENDANT 1782, England gold, pearls, diamonds, enamel, hair, glass, copper Gift of E. Howitt, 1893 © National Gallery of Victoria.